

considerable dynamism in terms of the cultural texts accessible by locals. The local punk and death metal cultures thus owe their origins in part to the awareness of, and support for, US indie rock outfits such as Green Day and Sonic Youth.

Given the title, I did expect a more thoroughgoing engagement with the growing body of work on music scenes per se. The relative absence of engagement with this literature does not detract from the quality of the work but may lead to some false expectations being brought to the reading process. Towards the end of the book we are provided with an insight into why the focus on scenes remains located within discourses of globalization rather than in musicology when the author surmises: 'the punk, death metal, and reggae identity practices, conveniently, although sometimes deceptively, referred to as "scenes," may more accurately be described as collections of scenic fragments, for genre-determined identities were constituted by tenuously connected instances of social spatialization' (p. 178). The research clearly illustrates how fluid networks operate in terms of time and space in specific geographic locales, while certainly not making any claims to site-specific origins for a unified or singular sound, which places it firmly beyond accepted understandings of what comprises a 'music scene'. A more direct engagement with how Bali's punk, death metal and reggae networks problematize music scenes thinking would have been a valuable addition to this body of literature, and helped situate the research more in terms of the book's title.

Viewing the music cultures under discussion through a frame inspired by Appadurai, Picard and (Victor) Turner on globalization, rather than Birmingham-style subcultural studies, *Making Scenes* represents music ethnography at its best. It offers a rich insight into the everyday lived experiences and meanings of punk, death metal and reggae, all the while fleshing this out as an individual and local community negotiation of complex national political change. It also valuably problematizes that old subcultural chestnut: 'commercial culture = bad/inauthentic'. Baulch approaches the idea of scenes less through some of the usual music studies theoretical frames, and more directly through a thorough ethnography of the music genre communities she studies. Though we're talking mostly about men's experience of subcultures here, the key strength of this book is the rich insider knowledge the author is able to offer as a result of her own observation within the communities under discussion. As a result *Making Scenes* provides an exemplary model of thoroughgoing music ethnography.



Nico Carpentier and Benjamin De Cleen (eds)
*Participation and Media Production: Critical Reflections
 on Content Creation*
 Newcastle, UK: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2008,
 ISBN 9781847184535

● Reviewed by Axel Bruns (Queensland University of Technology, Australia)

In spite of considerable interest in participative media in cultural studies and other fields, it is difficult to see exactly what audience this collection addresses; it adds up to less than the sum of its parts. The overall theme – participation and media

production – must be understood in the broadest possible sense. There is no special focus on what we may assume to be the obvious field of inquiry, online user-led content creation. Despite the subtitle, not all chapters provide ‘critical reflections on content creation’, online or elsewhere: at least two deal with media access and connectivity only.

The bulk of the 10 chapters are presented under the generic section-heading ‘Images/Sounds/Texts’ – an uninspiring choice, especially as it seems to shift focus further away from content *creation* itself, towards the content which results from participative media production processes. Ultimately, the section might just as well have been named ‘Other’: only the three chapters of the preceding ‘Critiques’ section really seem to pull in the same direction.

Judged on their own merits, a number of the chapters do present valuable insights. Nick Couldry offers a powerful critique of neoliberal, globalized politics, and in doing so contextualizes our present need for a study of new media as participatory media. Couldry notes the current ‘crisis of voice’ and highlights the need to investigate whether non-mainstream media offer an opportunity to alleviate this crisis.

Mark Deuze follows by outlining the spectre of corporate embrace, control, and co-option which has emerged in reaction to wider trends towards user-led participation and content creation. Retracing themes explored in more detail in his 2007 book *Media Work*, this chapter is a very useful overview of key issues in the study of participative media.

While Josh Lauer struggles valiantly – but ultimately unconvincingly – to apply the Marxian concept of ‘alienation’ to our everyday production of individual consumer profiles through the very act of consumption, his chapter, too, provides a useful basis for further thought and inquiry.

It is unfortunate that the themes outlined in these first few contributions are not systematically followed through in the collection that follows. That said, Gaye Tuchman and Stephen Ostertag do provide a useful overview of the impact of independent news blogs – if on the basis of a somewhat questionable definition of ‘news blog’, which is never fully thought through. The chapter then veers sideways unexpectedly, painting a dystopian picture of how ‘hypermedia’ have transformed Americans into ‘managed citizens’ (p. 63). The top-down, panopticon model of hypermedia outlined here seems at odds with the preceding section highlighting the independent media potential of news blogs.

Juanita Darling adds a well-researched investigation into the pre-history of modern newspapers in colonial Central America, chronicling the rise and fall of what today we might describe as user-generated content from the pages of these publications. Equally important, but not explicitly addressed here, is whether the continuing evolution of the media landscape may also lead to a reconfiguring of modern newspapers as electronic media take over the role of reporting on current events.

Isabel Awad’s contribution is interesting and well-argued but, while nominally engaging with the question of participation, it is one of the chapters that seems most out of place in this collection. She calls for a participatory politics of representation for ethnic (and specifically Latina/o) print media, arguing that media *for*

minorities is necessarily less able to achieve a representation of their perspectives than media *by* minorities themselves.

Robert Huesca's chapter similarly stands out, but for methodological reasons: his contribution details through personal interviews the outcomes for participants in radio production training schemes for youth in four locations across the United States. Both this and the preceding chapters make valuable contributions to their own fields of interest, and it is to be hoped that, even though hidden away in the present collection, they will be discovered by researchers interested in these topics.

Seungyoon Lee and Arul Chib take yet another approach and focus on network access in rural areas of the developing world, and the potential to improve such access through wireless initiatives. The chapter's convoluted conceptual framework unnecessarily complicates matters, and it manages to stretch even the already overly broad 'Images/Sounds/Texts' category by discussing participatory content-creation activities only in passing as a potential outcome of improved connectivity.

Katja Wittke and Patricia Aufderheide return once again to the core theme of the book with an insightful and methodologically innovative study of mainstream and online media coverage of *The War Tapes*, an Iraq War documentary compiled from footage shot by New Hampshire National Guard soldiers serving in Iraq. More information about the methodological framework of this research would have been very welcome.

Deborah Clark Vance's discussion of citizen videos from the post-Katrina New Orleans reconstruction effort is another potential highlight, but spends too much time in exposition, even reaching back as far as the early 20th century to outline the origins of the present US television environment. Concluding just as it gets interesting, it would have been desirable for this chapter to explore further the impact (or lack thereof) of such videos on public awareness at a time when mainstream US media have long since moved on to other topics.

Finally, as an afterword, the collection reprints Jay Rosen's well-known manifesto 'The People Formerly Known as the Audience'. In his three short pages, Rosen outlines more effectively than most of the other chapters the challenge for industry and researchers alike as they come to terms with the shift from consumption to participation, from production to 'produsage'. The book would have been well served – and a better collection – if more of its contributors had chosen to tackle these issues head on.



John Hartley

Television Truths,

Malden MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2008. 290 pp.

ISBN 9781405169790

● Reviewed by Peter Lunt (Brunel University of West London)

Television Truths attempts to develop a philosophy of television by reflecting on the emergent themes in the analyses of contemporary reality TV genres. The